

Key stage 2

Pupil B – Piece B: a balanced argument

Context: pupils read 'Pig Heart Boy' by Malorie Blackman and studied contemporary news reports. They discussed and then debated the ethics of using animal organs in humans, and the arguments raised in the debate formed the basis of this independent balanced argument piece. The corrections in green are the pupil's own.

Should xenotransplantation be allowed?

In our class (Year Six), we have been reading a book (Pig Heart Boy by Malorie Blackman) and the main character, Cameron, has only one chance - to have heart surgery by xenotransplantation. Xenotransplantation is a method where ^{Organs and tissues} are taken from a species and is then transplanted into a different species - or human body. There are many debates about using this method, both ^{positives} and negatives. Many people strongly believe that it's wrong but Cameron in Pig Heart Boy - is in desperate need for a xenotransplantation. In reality, David Bennett has recently had a xenotransplantation but people don't believe it's ^{necessary}. So should xenotransplantation be allowed?

Scientists claim that it is ^{necessary} to use Xenotransplantation as this method could save and improve lives. The key reason for this is so people can live longer, as sadly many people are dying - waiting for organs. New ^{research} shows it can work ^{successfully} so maybe we can start to use it when we have the chance? Without a doubt, there is negative comments about this but if we give it a chance this could be the future method we may use, which could save millions of lives all over the globe.

In an ideal world we shouldn't do xenotransplantation, when it could be ^{unsuccessful} as it's not really a suitable procedure. Xenotransplantation is a bad idea because it ^{can} bring moral issues to earth which means some other people don't agree. Having considered Xenotransplantation will give you a shorter life, since pig's organs do not last as long as human organs. It is argued that

Xenotransplantation will provide a risk of a high rejection rate, so we shouldn't risk our lives.

To conclude, I strongly believe that Cam (from Pig Heart Boy) should take this opportunity to live longer as he has a sibling on the way. I feel that this debate will continue, however I believe it's worth it to take the risk as animal organs are the only hope to save human lives.

Should xenotransplantation be allowed?

In our class (Year Six), we have been reading a book (Pig Heart Boy by Malorie Blackman) and the main character, Cameron, has only one choice – to have heart surgery by xenotransplantation. Xenotransplantation is a method where organs and tissues are taken from a species and is then transplanted into a different species- or human body. There are many debates about using this method, both positives and negative. Many people strongly believe that it's wrong but Cameron – in Pig Heart Boy – is in desperate need for an xenotransplant. In reality, David Bennett has recently had a xenotransplant but people don't believe it's necessary. So should xenotransplantation be allowed?

Scientists claim that it is necessary to use xenotransplantation as this method could save and improve lives. The key reason for this is so people can live longer, as sadly many people are dying – waiting for organs. New research shows it can work successfully so maybe we can start to use it when we have the chance? Without a doubt, there is negative comments about this but if we give it a chance this could be the future method we may use, which could save millions of lives all over the globe.

In an ideal world we shouldn't do xenotransplantation, when it could be unsuccessful as it's not really a suitable procedure. Xenotransplantation is a bad idea because it can bring moral issues to earth which means some other people don't agree. Having considered xenotransplantation will give you a shorter life, since pigs' organs do not last as long as human organs. It is argued that xenotransplantation will provide a risk of a high rejection rate, so we shouldn't risk our lives.

To conclude I strongly believe that Cam (from Pig Heart Boy) should take this opportunity to live longer as he has a sibling on the way. I feel that this debate will continue, however I believe it's worth it to take the risk as animal organs are the only hope to save human lives.